Knowledge and power relations: In a migration storytelling, Derviş Zaim's Film *Flashdrive*

Işıl Baysan Serim*

Abstract

Starting from Gilles Deleuze's (1989, p.59) concepts of "worldization" or/and "world-image" we should consider the intersection of cinema, architecture and storytelling as an act of thinking about "world-building". Because only such action takes us through creative and political stories that will enable us to understand why the cities of the future are migrant camps. Flashdrive doesn't just give us a refugee camp story; also maps the spatio-temporal distinctions of the survival journey. It presents a migration story shaped by media dispositifs and spatial dispositifs in which power and knowledge are articulated.

Keywords: Architecture, film, camp, cinema, city, civil war, dispositif, flashdrive, knowledge-power, media, refugee, storytelling, Scheherazade, World Building

1. Introduction

Why Scheherazade keeps on telling stories in the tales of *One Thousand and One Nights*)[1] ? (Burton, 2002) Inasmuch as, storytelling is tantamount to survival for her. By using the power of *knowledge* and language, she shows that stories can change lives, places, spaces, communities, kingdoms and various forms of power relations. The mythopoetic tales of Scheherazade have "lived on, like germ cells, in many literatures" (Byatt 1999) and also have inspired architecture, cinema, music, dance and performance in the world, for hundreds of years (Ouyang, 2003).

In Derviş Zaim's latest film, *Flashdrive* (2020), Scheherazade's art of storytelling becomes a metaphorical theme, a spatial, temporal and political allegory from the very first scene, extending from "a filmic form of storytelling to the architecture of filmic space itself" (Bruno, 2007, p.182). Within this context, Zaim (2022) turns his camera to the tragedy of the Syrian endless civil war2, which has been taking place next to Turkey for the last ten years and refers to this tale to remind the viewer "the value of storytelling." At that point, It is also possible to think that there is a parallelism between the ongoing "civil war" in Syria and the "sibling rivalry" in the tale (Ouyang, 2003, p.405). What has changed are the devices, the tools, and even the media (TV, video, film,

---

[1] Original title of the book is *Alf Layla wa-Layla* (interchangeably known as "The Arabian Nights"). Nevertheless, There are several different titles of the work interchangeably used in the literature. *The Thousand and One Nights*, *The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night* and *The Arabian Nights*, among others. For further information see, Mamet-Michalkiewicz, (2011).

[2] The Syrian civil war began in 2011 and, according to UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR, September 2022) operational updated report, since then, over half its population of 22 million have been forced to flee, often multiple times. In the present, there were approximately 6.9 million Syrians internally displaced and 6.9 million Syrian refugees mostly residing in neighboring countries of Turkey, Lebanon and Jordan. However, Turkey received the highest numbers of Syrian refugees with an estimated number of 3.6 million Syrians registered by the Government of Turkey (UNHCR, 2020) https://reporting.unhcr.org/document/3392

Architect, Independent researcher, Türkiye, ✉ *ibaysan@gmail.com*

radio, internet) of this war. Today there is a digital war in many aspects (digital surveillance, data tracking, spyware etc.) (Gold, 2018)

In what follows, *Flashdrive* which contains Scheherazade within Scheherazade fundamentally implies the great mythic themes, the cultural binaries of the human life that "correspond to the constructed poles of East and West" (Hopcroft, 2016) : "birth/ death, youth, maturation and decline, mind/body, reason/emotion, "civilization/ barbarity, progress/ stasis, self-control/violence, reality/dream, war/peace" (Hopcroft, 2016). The film scrutinizes the events in actual/virtual time sequences through the spaces encoded by power and knowledge relations arising from these binary situations.(Deleuze, 1989) Of course, here it is very crucial to understand "metaphor" as Jorge-Luis Borges (1993, pp.843-4) said: "There is no basic dissimilarity between the metaphor and what scientists call the explanation of a phenomenon. They both constitute a link established between distinct things ...Hence, when a geometrician asserts that the moon is a quantity that develops in three dimensions, his means of expression is no less metaphorical than that of Nietzsche, who prefers to define the same moon as a cat walking on top of the roofs."

In the film, *Scheherazade* firstly comes to view as a word, as the access code for a computer that an anti-regime dissident hacker forcibly opened under torture, during the Syrian civil war. In a video that appears as soon as the computer is turned on, we witness the slogans of the young dissidents in a street protest, implying the power of the words that Scheherazade used to avoid impending death: "To live is to tell stories. We must find stories to stop death. We must share our stories for life to go on." Such protests, with similar sentences, are brought up again and again, sometimes on the television screen, in a neighborhood, in the squares and sometimes in the traditional narrow streets of the city. Leyla, the heroine of the film uses the real story of Scheherazade while expressing the importance of storytelling so that children are not afraid of the war turmoil in two different sequences. To paraphrase Deleuze (1989:222) "Storytelling is not an impersonal myth, but neither is it a personal fiction: it is a word in act, a speech-act through which the character continually crosses the boundary which would separate his private business from politics, and which itself produces collective utterances."

Nevertheless, *One Thousand and One Nights* is based on a model that forms Arabian storytelling; it is inherent in a knowledge-power paradigm peculiar to medieval Arab-Islamic culture. (Burton, 2002) (Byatt, 1999) (Ouyang, 2003) Power, especially "political authority", is expressed in two counter-narratives, that is, "Shahriar's descent from power, followed by "the 'folk's' ascent to positions of authority" (Ouyang, 2003). In this way, the film refers to its literary tradition of using the frame-story as a platform from which to critique power. Reflecting on that tale the director observes such narratives reveal uneven relations of power across numerous storytelling scenarios. Thus, Flashdrive is a cinematic "storytelling as emergent political act" (Andrew, 2000, p.228).

2. Storytelling through Architecture, Cinema and Media

> *The encounter between two disciplines doesn't take place*
> *when one begins to reflect on another, but when one discipline realizes*
> *that it has to resolve, for itself and by its own means,*
> *a problem similar to one confronted by the other.*
> *Gilles Deleuze*

"Storytelling" says J. M. Coetzee (1988, p.5), is "another, *another* mode of thinking". Through this assertion, he means that a "story is a way of thinking - a non-analytic, archaic way of thinking." Otherworldly, it is such an invitation of reflection on what *it means to think*. Deleuze reveals the "image of thought" mechanism by tracing the unbreakable bond between image and thought in his cinema books, Movement-Image (1986) and *Time-Image* (1989). Both architecture and cinema "provokes us to see, to feel, to sense, and *finally to think differently*", (Flaxman, 2000, p. 2) that's why storytelling is a trajectory which provides to invent the new, unseen potentialities of spaces and times. Film and architecture provide a laboratory for the social and political actions that determine storytelling.

In recent years, prominent British production designer Alex McDowell (2015) suggested that the design technique "World Building", which he had employed in producing of some feature films[3], could also be used to bring "sustainable solutions" to "real world problems" such as the refugee crisis, the global warming, the pandemic, various disasters and so on. *World Building*[*], he says, as "the intersection of design, storytelling, and technology," will be significantly functional as well as operational on critical issues of humanity that are often neglected, such as the refugee problem (McDowell 2015). This technique enables to create conceptual visions of a problematized world in which characters can be inserted to test the pilot environment. According to McDowell (2021), through a global perspective, one of the things that quickly emerges from this process is that we will "start amassing this deep, informed view from multiple cultures." Within this motive, it becomes a non-profit institute (NGO), "a cutting-edge Organized Research Unit" dedicated to the dissemination, education and recognition of the "future of narrative media".

In line with this goal, in 2016, the *World Building Institute* (WBI, Los Angeles), collaborating with *Berlinale Talents*[4] , held a workshop, entitled "Migratory Narratives: Envisioning the Future world of the Refugee Camp" as part of the Berlin International Film Festival[5] In the festival, as based on the hypothesis of humanitarian expert Kilian Kleinschmidt, "the refugee camp is the city of the future", a number of workshops were held. "In Kilian's view, the camp is really the beginning of the city," said McDowell (2016). "If you flip the model, this kind of massive migration of populations is permanent; it's a constant state. So that's the premise. If you take that as the provocation, then how does that change what architecture needs to be? What about services? What about waste management? What does governance look like? How do you stop this being a kind of top-down governance with the UN or a local government coming in and just dictating?" Taking such problems as the axis, participants started to design with the question of "a generic refugee camp in the year 2036" "engaging collaborative, immersive, interdisciplinary world building processes, and using storytelling as a tool to try to comprehend this holistic and complex system."[6]

Young talents are asked to collaborate with interdisciplinary World Building Studio experts.[7] In the panel discussions held alongside the workshops, designers, architects, filmmakers, storytellers, humanitarian aid specialists and political actors who seek sustainable solutions to the complex spatio-temporal processes that determine refugee settlements came together to reveal the diversity of human narratives.

The end-works of the workshop, as McDowell (2016) puts it, are ultimately the products of 'post-cinema', formulated by storytelling and new media technologies. In this vein, it is also possible to talk about the relationship between 'post-cinema' and architecture, which replaced the socio-cultural agenda built by the mutual relationship between cinema and architecture in the 20th century. Kester Rattenbury (2002, p. xxiii), in the early years of the 21th century, points out that the "four of the key shifts in representation and media that affect architecture are perspective, photography, film and e-technology." Thus when Deleuze (1989:41) claims in his second cinema study, "Time is out of joint"[8] , he is depicting "a post-cinematic time, recalibrated by behaviour in

---

[3] McDowell (2015) remarked that he first developed the *World Building* technique for a sci-fi movie, Minority Report, (2002 directed by Steven Spielberg) which is set in the futuristic highrise city of Washington DC in the year 2054.
[*] https://worldbuilding.institute/about

[4] Berlinale Talents is the Berlin International Film Festival's talent development programme for the world's top 200 emerging filmmakers and series creators. https://www.berlinale-talents.de/bt/programme/event/2193
[5] *Migratory Narratives: The Future World of the Refugee Camp'* //Berlinale Talents 2016 https://worldbuilding.institute/events/berlinale-talents-world-building-studio
[6] World Building Institute - https://worldbuilding.institute/events/berlinale-talents-world-building-studio
[7] Workshop attendees included refugee expert Kilian Kleinschmidt, Google's head of VR filmmaking Jessica Brillhart, designer Talia Radford, and Puneet Ahira, an advisor to US president Barack Obama, who is understood to be preparing to launch a personal initiative that will focus on refugees. In the interview, McDowell emphasised how the project has attracted the attention of the White House and the UN, who want to make developing solutions to the refugee crisis a priority in the sunset of his presidency.
[8] Here Deleuze (1989:xi) refers to Hamlet's words which "signify that time is no longer subordinated to movement, but rather movement to time."

the world, but also by movements of world" (Colman, 2011, p.160). It's a post-war cinema that puts truth back in crisis.

As a result of the convergence of the information, communication and network technologies, computer, photography and cinema, "we are witnessing the emergence of a different media regime and indeed a different production style, than those which dominated the twentieth century" says Shaviro (2010:12). The realms of new forms of media, which also refers to a "postcinematic", "together with neoliberal economic relations, have given birth to radically new ways of manufacturing and articulating lived experience." (Shaviro, 2010b:2).

The film, *Flashdrive* (Derviş Zaim, 2020) that I will explore in this article, is not a digital work in this sense, even it is thoroughly cinematic and engages with the filmic medium. However, it is precisely the signs of time is what Deleuze (1989) defines as "crystal-image" or "crystalline narration" engaging in "political acts of storytelling" (Deleuze, 1989, p.243). "As if cinema has found the means of disconnecting itself from this 'true world' and becomes immanent to itself, a world of pure appearances." (Lambert, 2002, p. 94) The scenographic development of the film, needs the representation of various technologies such as live voices, some texts, photographic camera, smart phone, computer, lab-top, USB flash-drive, surveillance camera, drone warfare along with the medical engineering. "All forms of media have their own characteristics, biases and tendencies, as well as their own limitations." (Rattenbury, 2002, p.1)

Media theorist Henri Jenkins (2006) in his book *"Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide", offers a critical insight on the* new forms of production, interaction, and consumption that occur in the everyday spaces. "Convergence' says Jenkins (2006), is "a word that manages to describe technological, industrial, cultural, and social changes, depending on who's speaking and what they think they are talking about." These sea changes that will determine both social and private space should be considered beyond the technological process. "Representing a shift in cultural logic, whereby consumers are encouraged to seek out new information and make connections between dispersed media content", Jenkins (2006) suggests a "collective intelligence."

By the way, the title of the film, "Flashdrive" which literally means "a plug-and-play portable storage device", a gadget (Wilson, 2017), of this "ubiquitous digitization" (Rinken and Pötzschke 2022, p. 207) era, is the pivotal figure of the story. Otherworldly, beyond its literal function, the it can be considered as a 'diagrammatic' tool which connects the storytelling in different ways. Nevertheless, the flashdrive as a device, reminds us of the very change of memory's status in our culture through "time-space compression" (Harvey, 1991, p. 285) For what constitutes the 'flashdrive' is "precisely (..) its mixed status as an epistemological figure within a discursive order and an object within an arrangement of cultural practices." (Crary, 1992, p.31) To cite Deleuze (1988, p.13) again "Machines are social before being technicaL" Like all the machines we encounter along the film's itinerary, the flashdrive also cannot be reduced to a mere technological object or discursive figure. Each of them is "a complex social amalgam in which its existence as a textual figure was never separable from its machinic uses." (Crary, 1992, p. 31).

In this context, Foucault's (1980, p. 194) notion of dispositif 9 enables us to discuss all of them -architecture, film, cinema media, and storytelling.- According to Foucault, "dispositif " is a "…a thoroughly heterogeneous ensemble consisting of discourses, institutions, architectural forms, regulatory decisions, laws, administrative measures, scientific statements, philosophical, moral and philanthropic propositions – in short, the said as much as unsaid. Such are the elements of the apparatus. The apparatus itself is the system of relations that can be established between these elements." However

before Foucault, the concept was used by the film theorist Jean-Louis Baudry (1976; 1980) in 1970s.

---

[9] As Giorgio Agamben, who continued to think about the dispositif concept after Foucault and took the term to another level, stated, this is a technical term, just like Plato's idea. Indicates that it should not be changed.

Through the notion of the dispositif, Michel Foucault produced one of the most influential works on the subject of power and knowledge. Power is often seen as a negative and oppressive force, but he was one of the first to discuss power as a powerful means of production and positivity in society. Foucault (1980) famously uses the term "power" along with "knowledge" to indicate that those who are strongest are those who guarantee scientific understanding, existing norms of knowledge, and accepted ones: "If power were never anything but repressive, if it never did anything but say no, do you think one could be brought to obey it? What makes power hold good, what makes it accepted, is simply the fact that it doesn't only weigh on us as a force that says no, but that it traverses and produces things; it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse. It needs to be considered as a productive network which runs through the whole social body, much more than as a negative whose function is repression".

3. Topology of Survival Story

To live is to tell stories.
We must find stories to stop death
We must share our stories for life to go on

As the Thousand and *One Nights shows*, oral narration and storytelling are an important part of Eastern cultures. The idiosyncratic position of the young opponents stems from this tradition. In any Syrian city that reflects the seemingly endless labyrinths of stories trapped inside the stories, young dissidents become the media of the street. After the opening sequence, archival footage of the siege of the city of Deraa during the 2011 Arab Spring protests in Syria fills the screen. People shout as "With our blood, with our souls, we'll save you, Darea! Everyone in this town is powerful!" The filmmaker prefers to deploy TV media, through historical lenses for representing the turmoil of the city and its inhabitants. These events are watched on television in the houses and cafes of the city where the film takes place.

Later, the camera begins to watch and follow the street protests in the neighborhood where Leyla and Ahmet Rıfkı live. It chases the camera through the labyrinthine narrow streets of urban space. At the same time, Leyla and Ahmet Rıfkı and their other neighbors are watching the protests from the windows. Camera focuses their -gridal- frames as the cinematic equivalent of Renaissance theorician Alberti's (2011) pictorial metaphor in the Renaissance as a window-onto-the-world. As a viewing device, it becomes an 'instrument of the gaze', a kind of 'camera obscura on an urban scale' (Jacobs, 2011, p. 551). Thus, the actual and virtual space intertwine as well as transform. Sequences which show the militarization and politicization of space, surveillance of bodies and discipline are overlapped. It is what Foucault (1984, p.245) emphasizes: "…(t)here always remain the possibilities of resistance, disobedience, and oppositional groupings ... liberty is a practice."

In this way the film engages simultaneously real and virtual space and time, that reveal the uncanny visage of the city. Throughout the film, the sound itself has become an image, or/and turns into a space not a "component of the visual image", in Deleuze's (1989, p.278) words; it is a formation of a sound-framing. Thus, the "sound-image" and the "visual-image" form two separate frames, implying "a limit-situations which pushes" the characters to the point of dehumanized cityscape. (Deleuze, 1989, p. 5) According to Deleuze (1989, p.286), such a "sound image frames a mass or a continuity from which the pure speech act is to be extracted, that is, an act of myth or story-telling which creates the event, which makes the event rise up into the air, and which rises itself in a spiritual "ascension. And the visual image for its part frames an *any-space-whatever*, an empty, ruined, abandoned or/and disconnected space which takes on a new value, because it will bury the event under strati-graphic layers, and make it go down like an underground fire which is always covered over." (Deleuze, 1989, p. 267)

The layered and intermeshing urban and socio-political events, the civil war are turning Syrian city into what the Humm-based architect define. By witnessing this social and historical transformation from the inside, the architect Marwa al-Sabouni (2016) asks how Syria's architecture paved the way for the war: "Architecture in my country has played an important role

in creating, directing and amplifying conflict between warring factions, and this is probably true for other countries as well. (..) While many reasons had led to the Syrian war, we shouldn't underestimate the way in which, by contributing to the loss of identity and self-respect, urban zoning and misguided, inhumane architecture have nurtured sectarian divisions and hatred. Over time, the united city has morphed into a city center with ghettos along its circumference. And in turn, the coherent communities became distinct social groups, alienated from each other and alienated from the place."

4. The Topology of Knowledge and Power

In the opening sequence of the film, a group of Assad regime soldiers torture a hacker and ask for the password to the computer: 'What is the password?' The hacker replies, "The code is *Scheherazade*". When they take a break from the torture and go outside, we realize that the hacker is in an abandoned institutional building. Just at this moment, the protagonist of the film, Ahmet Rıfkı, who is talking in front of the building, and the other soldier are shot by a sniper.

When you watch what is reflected in the media, it can be immediately understood that this scene is ordinary for Syria. It is the "the militarization of everyday life" which has penetrated to everywhere. As a result of this attack, Ahmet Rıfkı loses his ability to speak and he starts working in a special unit, "The Military Intelligence Directorate" *(Mukhabarat)*. He has been collecting photographic and video evidence of people who have been killed. Together with Ahmet Rıfkı, we witness the taxonomies of death and so politicization of the human body.

What Roland Barthes (1982, p.88) calls the "evidential force" of the photograph was, therefore, "[a] complex historical outcome (..) exercised by photographs only within certain institutional practices and within particular historical relations the investigation of which will take us far from an aesthetic or phenomenological context. The very idea of what constitutes evidence has a history (..) a history which implies definite techniques and procedures, concrete institutions, and specific social relations—that is, relations of power."

Foucault (1997, pp.239-40 / p.266) asks set of questions in *Society Must be Defended*, "Must war be regarded as a primal and basic state of affairs, and must all phenomena of social domination, differentiation, and hierarchization be regarded as its derivatives? Do processes of antagonism, confrontations, and struggles among individuals, groups, or classes derive in the last instance from general processes of war? Can a set of notions derived from strategy and tactics constitute a valid and adequate instrument for the analysis of power relations?"

5. The Immigration Topology: Escape to Life[*]

Using new application of his mobile phone, Ahmet Rıfkı types on his mobile phone 'What is the shortest route to Turkey?' and plays this text to his wife. Despite Leyla's opposition, the first step to escape to Turkey was taken with this sentence, which Ahmet Rıfkı uttered through Obama's free of charge voice. While people are wondering whether Obama will keep his word for peace in the country, ironically only Obama's voice in the app is free. Leyla says she can't choose another voice because she needs a credit card. For her, it is much more important that Ahmet Rıfkı will be able to communicate through this application.

This is how the story of fleeing begins. The remnants of the horror and destruction experienced are the moonlight, the scattered corpses, the sights left by the Syrian forces as well as the guerrilla warfare by Free Syrian Army, ISIS, (or other armed groups). In Deleuze's (1989, p.xi) words, these are "*any spaces whatevers*, deserted but inhabited, disused warehouses," and ruined buildings. "Qualities and powers" writes Deleuze (1986, p.141), "are no longer displayed in any-space-

---

[*] I barrowed this title from Erika and Klaus Mann's 1939 book, 'Escape to Life: The Erika and Klaus Mann Story' which has focused on the life and 'culture of the exiled German artists, scholars and political figures during the initial part of Nazi era, before the outbreak of World War II' (Wikipedia)

whatevers, no longer inhabit originary worlds, but are actualized directly in determinate, geographical, historical and social space-times."

Thus, while fleeing to Turkey, due to a series of horrible events, the camera, which constantly tries to pin down the couple in close-ups, now moves even faster than Leyla and Ahmet Rıfkı. When the camera is in motion in this way, it does not merely follow the movements of the characters or undertake only the movements of which they are the object, but also subordinates the description of the spaces they pass through to the functions of thought. There is no simple distinction here between "subjective and objective", "real and imaginary", on the contrary, "their on the contrary their indiscernibility which will endow the camera with a rich array of functions, and entail a new conception of the frame and reframings" (Deleuze, 1989, p. 23). Concludely, Leyla and Ahmet no longer know what is "imaginary or real", "physical or mental". Because there is no place to even ask anymore.

Indeed the dehumanized landscape of the escape route cannot be better explained than by Susan Sontag (2002, p.5): "They show how war evacuates, shatters, breaks apart, levels the built world. A bomb has torn open the side of a house. To be sure, a cityscape is not made of flesh. Still, sheared-off buildings are almost as eloquent as body parts." *Time in* Flashdrive is certainly as Borges depicts it in 'The Garden of Forking Paths': "it is not space but time which forks, 'web of time which approaches, forks, is cut off or unacknowledged for centuries, embracing every possibility."[*] Thus, in Deleuze (1989, p.125) words, "the image no longer has space and movement as its primary characteristics but topology and time."

Based upon "true" episodes from life, *Flashdrive* is also able to portray scenes that would be difficult to film in actuality. For example, the death of many people, the explosion of landmines, bombardments, children and traffickers trying to cross the border as a result of missiles fired from a drone following a meeting with the human trafficker, where prospective immigrants, (Ahmet Rıfkı, Leyla and the others) paid for crossings. All these sequences are shot in a very, convincingly documentary style. As Homi Bhaba (1992, p.88) reminds us that "The globe shrinks for those who own it; for the displaced or the dispossessed, the migrant or refugee; no distance is more awesome than the few feet across borders or frontiers."

6. Epilogue : Survival

You can replace your homeland or have none,
but you have always, no matter where, to dwell.
Vilém Flusser

After crossing the dangerous minefield, the border is the starting line for Leyla and Ahmet Rıfkı's perhaps forever "out-of-place" will be "a secure fence with watchtowers" (Bauman, 2008, p.38). In the sequence that comes after Leyla and Ahmet Rıfkı step under the barbed wire at the border and set foot on Turkish soil, aerial footage of the refugee camp covers the screen. This is the "*Nizip 2 Container City*", which is built next to the Euphrates River and consists of nearly 1000 prefabricated container barracks surrounded by double barbed wire fences, guard towers and CCTVs in the *Nizip* town of southeastern province of the city of Gaziantep. Like most of the camps in Turkey, this institutional camp also is located in close proximity to the border.

The camp footages in general make visible a large global community of forcibly displaced people. These scenes also reveal the governance system and spatial dynamics of the real story behind the film. The official person Leyla and Ahmet met to start living in the camp is the manager of AFAD (*Government Agency for Disaster Management*)[*] who is responsible from all services and operational affairs. Together with Ahmet or Leyla, or through the director's eye, we identify the everyday spaces of the camp. For example, after the Camera detects Ahmet in the clinic room in

---

[*] I borrow this anectode from Deleuze's Time-Image.
[*] All works at large-scale camp planning, construction and operation projects are managed in coordination with the Turkish Red Crescent by AFAD, which is directly affiliated with the Prime Ministry.

the camp, it follows him pass through the unidentified corridors until the exit and drops him back to the asphalt-textured corridors of the camp. As Liisa Malkki (1995, p.2) writes, "The refugee camp was a vital device of power [...] Through these processes [of the refugee camp], the modern, postwar refugee emerged as a knowable, nameable figure and as an object of social-scientific knowledge."

Leyla and Ahmet approach the journalists in front of the TV broadcast vehicle standing in a certain part of the camp and says, "We have a story on Syria... that might interest you. About the acts of violence against humanity made by the regime." Ahmet Rıfkı's facial expression and gestures while showing a few print-out photographs of the mutilated bodies to them almost bring to mind Edward Munch's 'The Scream' (1893) painting. All the words that had accumulated in his silence seemed to be expressed in Susan Sontag's (2002) poetic screaming: "Look, the photographs say, this is what it's like. *This* is what war *does*. And that, *that* is what it does, too. War tears, rends. War rips open, eviscerates. War scorches. War dismembers. War ruins." The photographs taken by Ahmet Rıfkı are the windows to the war. He personally witnessed the war and the cruelty of war with a camera. And as with the true story that forms the background of the film, the flashdrive that stores 11,000 photos documenting the regime's violence against civilians and opponents is now the pivotal figure of the storytelling.

Even though we are surrounded by screens of "nonstop imagery (television, streaming video, movies)", "but when it comes to remembering, photography has a deeper bite" says Sontag (2002). "Memory freeze frames; its basic unit is a single image" (Sontag, 2002). In an era where power and knowledge are increasingly isomorphic, Zaim reveals the political influence of photography and film in storytelling.

7. Conclusion

- They are refugees.
-Yes. As, perhaps, we will become in the future.
Stephen Baxter

Greg Lambert (2002, p.13), tracing Deleuze's second cinema study, "The Time Image", draws attention to the spatial-temporal traumas after the Second World War: "We are all survivors; our memories are stricken by an irretrievable trauma The earth is laid waste by a paralysis of memory and zones of impossibility: death camps, burned-out cities, atomic sink-holes, summer fields yielding each year a new harvest of corpses."

Today, *Flashdrive* remind us, *all we are in refugee camps**, about which millions of stories are told and which are simultaneously served to every corner of the world via mobile media. Kilian Kleinschmidt (2016) stated that "refugee camps are the cities of the future" and that "the average duration of a refugee situation is 17 years". Therefore, refugee camps resemble permanent settlements rather than temporary settlements. It is expanding. Admittedly, this is the creation of the 'spatial states of exception' that Agamben emphasizes for the design and construction of new camps: "places of bare life which are subject to the law but can itself never actively invoke it." Hence, developing a notion of human "refugium" from Arendt's work on the "public sphere", he refers to such an aterritorial space. It is with this common sense that Agamben attempts to re-read Hannah Arendt's (1974) 1943 article, entitled "We Refugees" in which the situation of refugees defined 'the vanguard of humanity', after fifty years. According to him, today Arendt's fundamental insight has been historically proven.

As aforementioned above, *Flashdrive* passes through a dualism, which corresponds to both aspects of the Deleuzian "time-image": "a cinema of the body, which puts all the weight of the past into the body, all the tiredness of the world and modern neurosis; but also, a cinema of the brain, which reveals the creativity of the world, its colours aroused by a new space-time, its powers multiplied by artificial brains." For that reason, the family name of the refugee Turkmen kid,

---

* At this point, Giorgio Agamben's

Dünyazad[*] which means 'world-person' or "born of this world",makes very critical sense here. Also Remember, Nietzsche's (1974:338) aphorism 377 titled "We Who are Homeless," defines migrants as the "children of the future": We are unfavourable to all ideals which could make us feel at home in this frail, broken-down, transition period; and as regards the 'realities' thereof, we do not believe in their endurance."

References

Agamben, G. (1994) We refugees (trans. M. Rocke). 1994. http://www.egs.edu/faculty/agamben/agamben-we-refugees.html

Agamben, G.(1998) (1998) *Homo Sacer: Sovreign Power and Bare Life*, trans. Daniel Heller-Roazen (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998)

Agamben, G. (2005) *States of Exception*, trans. Kevin Attell (Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Agamben, G. (2005) "What is a Dispositor? [*Quel Est Dispositif?*]" (lecture transcript by Jason Michael Adams) (2005),

https://eclass.upatras.gr/modules/document/file.php/ ARCH213/Agamben%20Dispositor.pdf, and Giorgio Agamben, *What is an Apparatus? And Other Essays* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2009),

Agier, M. (2002). "Between War and City Towards an Urban Anthropology of Refugee Camps." *Ethnography* 3(3): 317–41. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2404811

Agier, M. (2016) "Borderlands: Towards an Anthropology of the Cosmopolitan. Condition. Translatrd by :Cambridge : Polity Press

Alberti, L. B. (2011*). On Painting: A New Translation and Critical Edition*. Sinisgalli, R. (Trans.). New York: Cambridge University Press

Al-Sabouni, M. (How Syria's architecture laid the foundation for brutal war?

https://www.ted.com/talks/marwa_al_sabouni_how_syria_s_architecture_laid_the_foundation_for_brutal_war/transcript

Andrew, D. (2000) The Roots of the Nomadic: Gilles Deleuze and the Cinema of West Africa. In: *The Brain Is the Screen: An Interview with Gilles Deleuze* Minnesota : University of Minnesota, 215-249

Bruno, G. (2007) Public Intimacy : Architecture and the Visual Arts. Cambridge, London : The MIT Press

Barth, J. (2001) *Dunyazadiad, Chimera*, Boston, New York: Houghton Mifflin Company

Barthes, R. (1982) *Camera Lucida: Refections on Photography,* trans. Richard Howard, London: Jonathan Cape

Baudry, J. L. (1980). *Ideological effects* of the basic cinematographic *apparatus*. In: *Kyung-Cha, T. H. (Ed). Apparatus*: *Selected Writings,* New York: Tanam Press.

Baudry, J. L. (1976). The aparatus. *Camera Obscura: Feminism, Culture, and Media Studies,* Volume 1, Number 1(1), Fall, 104-126.

Bauman, Z. (2008). Does Ethics Have a Chance in a World of Consumers?, Cambridge, London: Harvard University Press.

Bauman, Z. (2017) *Wasted lives: modernity and its outcasts*. Cambridge : Polity

Borges, J.L. (1999) "The Translators of *The Thousand and One Nights*." *Selected Non-Fictions*, edited by Eliot Weinberger, Viking, pp. 92-108.

Borges, J.L. (1980) The Thousand and One Nights. In: *Seven Nights.* Trans. A. Donald. New York : New Direction

Borges, J.L. (1993) La métaphore. In *Autour de l'ultraïsme: Articles non recueillis*, Paris: Oeuvres complètes, Bibliothèque de la Pléiade, Gallimard.

Burton R. F. (2002). *The Book of The Thousand Nights and a Night*. Oxford.

Byatt, A.S. (1999) 'Narrate Or Die : Why Scheherazade keeps on talking'

https://archive.nytimes.com/www.nytimes.com/library/magazine/millennium/m1/byatt.html?scp=14&sq=georgette%252520heyer&st=cse

Colman, F. (2011) *Deleuze and Cinema: The Film Concepts*, New York: Berg

Deleuze, G. (1986). *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*, H. Tomlinson and B. Habberjam (trans.). London: Athlone.

Deleuze, G. (1989) *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, H. Tomlinson and R. Galeta (trans.). London: Athlone.

Deleuze, G. (1997). The Brain is the Screen, An interview with Gilles Deleuze', in Gregory Flaxman. Ed. *The Brain* is *the Screen: Deleuze and the Philosophy* of *Cinema,* Routledge: London

---

[*] For further reading, see the study of Qassim Salman Sarhan Marwa Ali Al-Shara (2017) "John Barth's "Dunyazadiad": A Postmodern Reading of an Eastern Frame"

Foucault, M. (1980) The Confession of the Flesh. Interview. In C. Gordon (Ed.) *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977.* Brighton, UK: Harvester Press. 1994-228

Foucault, M. (1980) 'Two Lectures.' In C. Gordon (Ed.) *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977.* Brighton, UK: Harvester Press. 78–109 [trans., orig. 1976].

Foucault M (1995) Discipline and punish. The birth of the prison (2nd edn). Vintage Books: New York

Foucault, M. (2003) *Society Must be Defended: Lectures at the Collège de France 1975–1976*. Bertani, M., Fontana, A., & Ewald, F. eds. Translated by Macey, London: Allen Lane/Penguin.

Gordon, C., Ed. (1980) *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge*. Brighton: The Harvester Press.

Hailey, C. (2009). *Camps: A guide to 21st-century space*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Jenkins, H. (2006). Convergence Culture: *Where Old and New Media Collide*. New York: New York University Press.

Hopcroft, H. F. (2016) Animals, Sex and the Orient: a feminist retelling of the *Arabian Nights,* Thesis submitted for the award of a Doctorate of Philosophy

Kleinschmidt, K. (2015) Interview With A Former Refugee Camp Manager Kilian Kleinschmidt. https://youth-time.eu/interview-with-a-former-refugee-camp-manager-kilian-kleinschmidt/

Kleinschmidt, K. (2016) Technology & Innovation in Refugee Camps. https://www.carnegiecouncil.org/media/series/gt/20160415-new-paradigms-for-refugee-camps-and-for-humanitarian-aid-itself

Kleinschmidt, K. (2018) All cities are refugee camps. https://vimeo.com/250086011?embedded=true&source=vimeo_logo&owner=15114789

Lambert, G. (2002) The Non-Philosophy of Gilles Deleuze. London, New York : Continuum

Lelii, S., Wilson, S. (2017) 'USB Flash Drive' https://www.techtarget.com/searchstorage/definition/USB-drive

Nietzsche, F. (1974) *The Gay Science: With a Prelude in Rhymes and an Appendix of Songs*, transl. by Walter Kaufmann, New York: Vintage Books

Shaviro, S. (2010) Post-Cinematic Affect. Zone Books

Leeuwen, R. (2007)*The Thousand and One Nights: Space, Travel and Transformation*. New York 1.

Shaviro, S. (2010a) *Post-Cinematic Affect.* Winchester: Zero Books

Shaviro, S. (2010b) "Post-Cinematic Affect: On Grace Jones, *Boarding Gate* and *Southland Tales*," *Film Philosophy* 14, no. 1, http://www.film-philosophy.com/index.php/f-p/article/view/220/173,

Weizman, E. (2007). *Hollow land: Israel's architecture of occupation*. London: Verso.

Resume

Işıl Baysan Serim is a qualified architect and a researcher as well as the founder and editor-in-chief of the Sinetopya City, Film and Architecture Magazine. She is a part-time lecturer in the Faculty of Architecture at Bahçeşehir University and Kent University in Istanbul. Her research interests include cinema and architecture, and transdisciplinary knowledge production in architecture such as social theory, political philosophy, technology, urbanism and migration. She regularly gives public talks at national and international institutions and conferences as a film and architecture curator. Işıl was a researcher at Yeditepe University and taught at Bilgi University and Medipol University.